# HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION AGENDA MEETING OCTOBER 17, 2013 6:30 PM ACTION SUMMARY

Commissioners present: Arp, Bailey, Foster, Hernly, Quillin

Commissioners excused: Tuttle

Staff present: Braddock Zollner, Cargill

## ITEM NO. 1: ACTION SUMMARY

Receive Action Summary from the August 15, 2013 and September 26, 2013 meetings. Approve or revise and approve.

### **ACTION TAKEN**

Approval of minutes deferred.

### ITEM NO. 2: COMMUNICATIONS

- a) There were no communications from other commissions, the State Historic Preservation Officer, or the general public.
- b) Commissioner Hernly declared his abstentions for Item #4 and Administrative Review No. DR-13-00334, DR-13-00364, and DR-13-00392.

**ITEM NO. 3:** East Historic District, University of Kansas. Submitted by James E. Modig on behalf of the University of Kansas, property owner of record.

## **APPLICANT PRESENTATION**

Ms. Elizabeth Rosen, for Rosen Preservation, presented the item.

Commissioner Foster asked why there are two different districts.

Ms. Rosen replied that, logistically the KU Historic District was easier to move forward with while the KU East Historic District required more work.

Commissioner Foster asked for clarification as to whether Smith Hall was included because it would be contributing at some point in the future and noted that other scholarship halls were left out.

Ms. Rosen said others were left out because they were so new or would create an odd boundary and that National Register requires fairly square boundaries.

Commissioner Hernly asked if Ms. Rosen could provide the Commission with information regarding the demolition of Oread High School.

Ms. Rosen said that Oread High School would have been non-contributing to this district because it did not share the residential and religious context that this district was being nominated for.

Commissioner Hernly asked if it was not considered historically significant to the community.

Ms. Rosen responded that its historic significance is a separate issue.

Foster asked if it was documented before it was demolished.

Ms. Rosen said yes it was part of their survey work.

Commissioner Hernly said he thinks it is great that KU is putting together historic districts because it will help protect many buildings and hopefully emphasize the importance of preservation efforts in Lawrence.

Commissioner Arp asked what the next stage is or if these are the principal districts.

Ms. Rosen said that the two aforementioned districts are the results of their survey work.

## **NO PUBLIC COMMENT**

# **COMMISSION DISCUSSION**

Commissioner Arp asked if it was recommended they send a letter encouraging advancement of their nomination.

Ms. Zollner said yes to the Kansas Historic Sites Board of Review.

### **ACTION TAKEN**

Motioned by Commissioner Arp, seconded by Commissioner Foster, directing staff to send a letter to the Kansas Historic Sites Board of Review recommending approval of the University of Kansas East Historic District.

Unanimously approved 5-0.

TEM NO. 4: DR-13-00372 700 Ohio Street; Garage Demolition and New Construction; State Preservation Law Review. The property is located in the Old West Lawrence Historic District, National Register of Historic Places. Submitted by Hernly Associates for Richard and Xanthippe Wedel, the property owner of record.

Commissioner Hernly abstained from the item and exited the room.

## **STAFF PRESENTATION**

Ms. Zollner presented the item.

Commissioner Arp asked how staff was able to determine the age of the structure.

Ms. Zollner said the construction method and placement of the structure are factors in determining age, but there are no identifying characteristics that make it a contributor to the district other than the fact that it is an old structure.

Commissioner Arp asked if she thought it was built before or after 1930.

Ms. Zollner said she believes it was built later than 1930.

Mr. Mike Myers, applicant, said it was his understanding that the structure was built in the 1950s.

# **APPLICANT PRESENTATION**

Mr. Mike Myers, Hernly & Associates, presented the project on behalf of the property owners. He said they are in agreement with staff's opinion of the existing garage, and added that there is significant deterioration at the foundation. He stated they have done several things to reduce the scale of the new garage in an attempt to make it more compatible with the house. He said he hoped that the commission would find the structure to be non-contributing and the plans for the new garage to be suitable.

## NO PUBLIC COMMENT

Commissioner Foster said that of all the garages the commission has reviewed this is the only two-story garage and most likely the largest.

Ms. Zollner agreed that it is a large structure, which is a staff concern, although the slope of the lot does help. She added the size is within the range of structures in the district.

Commissioner Foster asked whether any had been reviewed by the Historic Resources Commission (HRC).

Ms. Zollner said yes, some had been reviewed, including some two-story structures.

Commissioner Quillin asked for thoughts as to the contributing status of the structure.

The commission came to the consensus that the structure is not contributing.

Commissioner Foster made comments about the proposed structure's balcony indicating it looked a little too modern.

Commissioner Quillin agreed that the slope helps with the scale of the building.

Commissioner Arp said he felt the structure was compatible with other historic buildings in the area. He asked for staff's thoughts on the proposed structure's balcony.

Ms. Zollner said it was not typical for the area.

Commissioner Arp said it seems a little out of character.

Commissioner Foster reiterated his concerns with the balcony, particularly the lack of detail on the posts.

Commissioner Quillin asked if it would help just to treat the balcony in a different way.

Commissioner Foster said yes it would help, and noted that it is set back from the street so it wouldn't be terribly prominent. He raised a concern as to whether the lap siding would match the house.

Mr. Myers said the lap siding would match the house. He said it is difficult to determine how much detail to include in making a new structure appear old. He mentioned there are many two-story accessory structures in the neighborhood and it is not uncommon for them to have balconies.

Commissioner Arp asked if there could be a way to address Commissioner Foster's concerns with the balcony.

Mr. Myers said yes, they could make some minor adjustments; for example, the columns could be treated in a different way.

Commissioner Foster asked whether the off-center window placement was intentional, referring to discussions with the Oread Design Guidelines and similar issues with window alignment.

Mr. Myers said the goal was just to get natural light into the garage, and asked if the concern was with the symmetry of the window, although he didn't feel it was odd or uncommon.

Commissioner Foster said it was just a thought stemming from his work with the Oread Design Guidelines but it doesn't necessarily apply in this situation.

Commissioner Arp asked what the implications are for approving the construction of a balcony on an accessory structure.

Ms. Zollner stated that each application is reviewed individually, but she did think it could be used as an example when reviewing future projects. She said she is aware of two-story accessory structures with exterior stairs but none with a balcony.

Commissioner Arp asked if there is a rule regarding the habitability of certain accessory structures.

Ms. Zollner said this zoning district does not allow accessory dwelling units. She said this structure is not considered an accessory dwelling unit because it does not have a full kitchen.

Commissioner Foster suggested the project go before the Architectural Review Committee (ARC) as a condition of approval to address the modern look of the proposed balcony.

Ms. Zollner asked if the height of the structure should be reviewed by ARC as well as the balcony.

Commissioner Foster said he is more concerned with setting a precedent for future two-story accessory structures, but not entirely opposed to this particular project.

## **ACTION TAKEN**

Motioned by Commissioner Foster, seconded by Commissioner Arp, to approve the project as per staff recommendation with the amendment that revisions to the balcony be reviewed by the ARC.

Motion carried 4-0-1.

Commissioner Hernly returned to the meeting.

DR-13-00387 645 Ohio Street; Addition, Demolition and New Construction; State Preservation Law Review. The property is a contributing structure to the Old West Lawrence Historic District, National Register of Historic Places. Submitted by Dan Hermreck for Jon Heeb on behalf of Winthrop West LLC, the property owner of record.

# **STAFF PRESENTATION**

Ms. Zollner presented the item.

Commissioner Foster mentioned there are structures on 7<sup>th</sup> Street where a full two-story version has been built but most likely too long ago to have gone through HRC.

Ms. Zollner said there were none that she is aware of.

Commissioner Hernly asked if there are any issues with the basement affecting setback requirements from the alley.

Ms. Zollner said she was unsure but would look into it.

Commissioner Hernly pointed out that the new construction appears to be an accessory structure but is in fact connected to the main structure which may pose zoning issues.

## APPLICANT PRESENTATION

Mr. Dan Hermreck, on behalf of the property owner Jon Heeb, wants to emphasize their intentions of taking the structure from a multi-family to a single family property. He explained that the design will accommodate modern living amenities, such as an outdoor living area. He said there is no basement below the garage and it would not extend all the way out to the alley. He believes that the point of contention is the idea that the combination of the breezeway roof and the garage door create an addition that is not compatible with a historic property. He provided a photo of an example.

Commissioner Foster asked what an egress areaway is.

Mr. Hermreck said the basement requires a secondary egress areaway, in this case a ladder.

Mr. Hermreck explained his photo examples. He said he agrees with staff's recommendations regarding the garage door and has come up with some ideas that would minimize the visual impact of the breezeway. He said they would be willing to eliminate the overhead door and the columns that flank it on either side, and also suggested adjustments to the roof or the addition of several skylights.

Commissioner Foster observed that the proposed garage door is in the same plane as the kitchen wall.

Mr. Hermreck said it is back a few inches.

Commissioner Foster expressed his concerns with the differences in the roofs.

Mr. Hermreck said he feels that differentiating between the breezeway and main structures is important.

Commissioner Foster likes the fact that it is open and suggested a more dramatic difference in the breezeway roof to create a significant break between the two structures.

Commissioner Quillin asked if there is a separate accessory garage.

Mr. Hermreck said no. He added that he understands that the overhead door will not work, and believes he can minimize the visual impact considerably, either by adding skylights or using transparent material.

# **PUBLIC COMMENT**

Mr. Dennis Brown, president of the Lawrence Preservation Alliance (LPA), said they are in favor of the changes being made to the property particularly because it is so prominent. He said the LPA's concern is that the breezeway blurs the line between attached and detached garages, which are character defining features. He said the LPA believes careful review of the breezeway is warranted so as not to set a precedent for future projects. He suggested a pergola might be a proper alternative for an outdoor living area as opposed to a structural connector.

## **COMMISSION DISCUSSION**

Commissioner Arp said he agreed with staff's recommendation that the space between the structures remain open, and feels that requirement would definitely warrant further review of the proposed plans.

Commissioner Foster asked if the other commissioners are open to any type of connection between the two structures.

Commissioner Quillin said she is concerned that approving the project with the connectors would be setting a precedent for future projects.

Commissioner Foster cited an example of a connected accessory structure that he feels is tasteful and maintains character.

Commissioner Bailey said he also sees the slippery slope argument and questions where to draw the line.

Commissioner Arp said that, if it is the consensus of the Commission to separate the two structures, the project should be referred to the ARC.

# **ACTION TAKEN**

Motioned by Commissioner Foster, seconded by Commisioner Arp, to approve the project as per staff recommendations with the amendment that the space between the primary structure and accessory structure be reviewed by the ARC, and that staff determine the setback requirements for the accessory structure.

Unanimously approved 5-0.

# ITEM NO. 6:

DR-13-00412 900 Rhode Island Street; Rehabilitation; State Preservation Law Review and Certificate of Appropriateness Review. The property is a contributing structure to the North Rhode Island Street Historic Residential District, National Register of Historic Places and is located in the environs of the Social Service League Building (905 Rhode Island), Lawrence Register of Historic Places. Submitted by David Dunfield for the Lawrence Preservation Alliance, the property owner of record.

Ms. Zollner introduced the item.

# **APPLICANT PRESENTATION**

Mr. David Dunfield introduced himself and said he would be happy to answer any questions about the project.

Commissioner Foster thanked Mr. Dunfield for beginning much needed work on the structure.

Mr. Dunfield said the building is in significant disrepair and there is not currently a budget to address all repairs at this time, so the most urgent issues are being addressed first.

They discussed the integrity of the structure, proposed improvements, and plans to monitor existing repair concerns.

Mr. Dunfield thanked the Commission for their input on the project.

### **PUBLIC COMMENT**

Ms. KT Walsh, East Lawrence Neighborhood Association, thanked the applicant for taking on the project.

# **ACTION TAKEN**

Motioned by Commissioner Arp, seconded by Commissioner Hernly, to approve the rehabilitation project as per recommendations in the staff report.

Unanimously approved 5-0.

### **ITEM NO. 7:** MISCELLANEOUS MATTERS

- A. There were no Board of Zoning Appeals applications received since September 26, 2013.
- B. There were no demolition permits received since the September 26, 2013 meeting.
- C. Review of Administrative and Architectural Review Committee approvals since September 26, 2013:

### **Administrative Reviews**

### DR-13-00334

814 Massachusetts Street; Commercial Remodel; State Preservation Law Review and Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District Review. The property is a contributing structure in Lawrence's Downtown Historic District, National Register of Historic Places and is located in the Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District. Submitted by Eric Jay of Struct/Restruct for George Paley on behalf of Gerling, Inc., the property owner of record.

#### DR-13-00353

716 E 9th Street; Site Plan; State Preservation Law Review and 8<sup>th</sup> and Pennsylvania Urban Conservation Overlay District Review. The property is listed as contributing open space to the East Lawrence Industrial District, National Register of Historic Places and is located in the 8<sup>th</sup> and Pennsylvania Urban Conservation Overlay District. Submitted by Darron Ammann of Bartlett & West, Inc. for Ohio Mortgage Investors LLC, the property owner of record.

#### DR-13-00354

1901 Massachusetts Street; Sign Permit; Certificate of Appropriateness Review. The property is located in the environs of Fire Station No. 2 (1839 Massachusetts), Lawrence Register of Historic Places. Submitted by Full Bright Sign & Lighting on behalf of La Bella Vita Hair Studio for Bahman Raisdana, the property owner of record.

## DR-13-00364

814 Massachusetts Street; Sidewalk Dining; State Preservation Law Review and Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District Review. The property is a contributing structure to Lawrence's Downtown Historic District, National Register of Historic Places, and is located in the Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District. Submitted by Mike Myers of Hernly Associates for Gerling LLC, the property owner of record.

#### DR-13-00377

729 New Hampshire Street; Sidewalk Dining; State Preservation Law Review, Certificate of Appropriateness Review and Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District Review. The property is a contributing structure to Lawrence's Downtown Historic District, National Register of Historic Places,

and is located in the environs of Millers Hall (723-725 Massachusetts) and the House Building (729 Massachusetts), Lawrence Register of Historic Places. The property is also located in the Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District. Submitted by Leticia Cole of Paul Werner Architects for Jean Hetzel Trustee, the property owner of record.

- DR-13-00379 645 Massachusetts Street; Sign Permit; Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District Review. The property is located in the Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District. Submitted by Michael Schmidt of Star Signs, LLC for Edmonds Duncan on behalf of GCB Holdings LC, the property owner of record.
- DR-13-00380

  1312 Vermont Street; Rehabilitation; Certificate of Appropriateness Review.
  The property is located in the environs of the Castle Tea Room (1307 Massachusetts), Lawrence Register of Historic Places. Submitted by Ronald Hutchens of Paul Werner Architects for Gordon Sailors Living Trust, the property owner of record.
- DR-13-00390 845 Massachusetts Street; Sidewalk Dining; State Preservation Law Review and Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District Review. The property is a contributing structure to Lawrence's Downtown Historic District, National Register of Historic Places, and is located in the Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District. Submitted by Leticia Cole of Paul Werner Architects for Gerling LLC, the property owner of record.
- DR-13-00392 1832 Massachusetts Street; Site Plan Review; Certificate of Appropriateness Review. The property is located in the environs of Fire Station No. 2 (1839 Massachusetts), Lawrence Register of Historic Places. Submitted by Mike Myers of Hernly Associates for Thomas and Linda Cottin, the property owners of record.
- PR-13-00402

  931 Massachusetts Street; Commercial Addition; State Preservation Law Review, Certificate of Appropriateness Review and Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District Review. The property is a contributing structure to Lawrence's Downtown Historic District, National Register of Historic Places, and is located in the environs of the Hanna Building (933 Massachusetts) and Plymouth Congregational Church (925 Vermont), Lawrence Register of Historic Places. The property is also located in the Downtown Conservation Overlay District. Submitted by Scott Trettel of Gria Inc. for Fayman Properties LLC, the property owner of record.
- DR-13-00406 821 Ohio Street; Residential Addition of Solar Panels; Certificate of Appropriateness Review. The property is located in the environs of the Jacob House Residence (805 Ohio), Lawrence Register of Historic Places. Submitted by Aaron Cromwell of Cromwell Environmental for Daniel Poull, the property owner of record.

# **ACTION TAKEN**

Motioned by Commissioner Arp, seconded by Commissioner Bailey, to confirm the Administrative Reviews.

Motion carried 4-0-1.

# D. General public comment.

Mr. Dennis Brown reminded the Commissioners of LPA's annual meeting on Sunday the 20<sup>th</sup> at 1:30 pm at the Turnhalle building. He also mentioned that Commissioners are invited to attend their next old housewarming on November 17<sup>th</sup> from 1:30-3:00 at 1734 Kent Terrace, the home of Jim and Shelley Hickman-Clark. Their home was up for nomination to the Lawrence Register of Historic Places and he hoped that it would be approved at the next City Commission meeting, along with Turnhalle and the Kibbie Farmstead.

Ms. KT Walsh said the East Lawrence Neighborhood Association is very disappointed that Treanor Architects is working on the 9<sup>th</sup> Street Corridor project with the Cultural District Task Force and will not support it if Treanor is involved. She mentioned Treanor Architects has many talented architects but they have not shown respect for historic preservation efforts in their past projects in the area.

# E. Miscellaneous matters from City staff and Commission members.

Ms. Zollner welcomed Commissioner Aaron Bailey and pointed out that the HRC now has a full commission. She said a full day of training could be scheduled on a Saturday or possibly at the November meeting.

The commissioners agreed to train at their November meeting.

Ms. Zollner said there are several property owners interested in Local Register nominations who would like feedback from the HRC. She said she would email the commissioners individually for their comments.

Commissioner Hernly asked if there is a staff member in charge of marketing who could draft that correspondence.

Ms. Zollner said she will send it to the city's communications coordinator.

Ms. Zollner mentioned the Board of Zoning Appeals did receive their recommendations for the Kwik Shop project and approved those variances with an amendment limiting the number of pumps from six to four. She also reminded the commission that several Local Register nominations would be heard at the upcoming City Commission meeting.

Commissioner Hernly asked when some of the other nominations will go to City Commission for approval.

Ms. Zollner said due to limited staff time she has amended the report to the City Commission in an effort to expedite the process. She said she hoped the remaining nominations would be approved before the end of the year.