

December 6, 2013

Lawrence, Kansas
Kaw WTP Raw Water Intake Project
City Project No. UT1102KA
City Bid No. B1359

B&V Project 176399
B&V File 14.2100

Mr. Philip E. Ciesielski, P.E.,
Assistant Director of Utilities
City of Lawrence
P O Box 708
Lawrence, KS 66044

Subject: Recommendation of Award - City Bid No. B1359

Dear Mr. Ciesielski,

We have reviewed the bids received on November 19, 2013 for the Kaw WTP Raw Water Intake Project, City Bid No. B1359. Bids were received on a lump sum basis (including two mobilizations/demobilizations for flooding) along with unit adjustment prices for dredging, permanent sheet pile, and mobilizations/demobilizations for flooding. The following is an alphabetical list of the contractor's lump sum bids that were received.

<u>Contractor</u>	<u>Lump Sum Bid</u>
Kissick Construction Company, Inc.	\$6,193,550.00
L.G. Barcus and Sons, Inc.	\$3,880,000.00
Wolf Construction, Inc.	\$3,800,000.00

The low bid was submitted by Wolf which was only \$80,000 less than the bid from Barcus. These bids were lower than the Engineer's opinion of probable construction cost of \$4,702,000. Kissick's bid was significantly higher than the other bids and the Engineer's opinion of probable construction cost. The enclosed bid tabulation summarizes the lump sum bid prices, unit adjustment prices, proposed subcontractors, and our review of the completeness of the bid package. Following receipt of the bids, Black & Veatch requested a completed List of Subcontractors, qualifications (project experience and descriptions), and proposed project manager and field superintendent from Wolf Construction, Inc. (Wolf) as well as L.G. Barcus and Sons, Inc. (Barcus) since their bid was competitive.

Qualifications

Minimum qualifications requirements were included in the bidding documents (Article 3.01 of the Instructions to Bidders) that consisted of the successful completion of at least two projects in water or wastewater treatment work of at least \$1,000,000 within the last ten years, one of which must include new intake construction or intake modifications. Both the Wolf and Barcus teams have raw water intake construction experience as noted below, but neither team demonstrated they had one

intake project similar to the cofferdam intake for this project that was greater than \$1,000,000 within last ten years. Pertinent qualifications information received from Wolf and their cofferdam subcontractor (Berkel) is summarized below:

- Lawrence (Kansas) and Jeffrey (Colorado) Energy Center projects by Wolf involving raw water intake pump station and piping modifications. Construction cost for the Lawrence and Jeffrey projects were \$700,000 and \$3,000,000, respectively.
- Fort Benning (Georgia) Raw Water Intake project by Berkel involving a sheet pile cofferdam for a construction cost of \$420,000. Intake was a concrete structure with wetwell and pumps built within the cofferdam near the shoreline of the Chattahoochee River.
- Galveston (Texas) WWTP expansion project by Berkel involving sheet pile and soldier pile work along the edge of a bay for a construction cost of \$920,000.

Pertinent qualifications information received from Barcus and their piping subcontractor (Redford Construction) is summarized below:

- Kansas River Bowersock Dam Modifications projects for Lawrence (Kansas) Water Impoundment projects by Barcus involving sheet pile work. Construction cost for the upstream and downstream modifications were \$1,500,000 and \$2,300,000, respectively.
- St. Joseph (Missouri) Water Intake by Barcus involving a sheet pile intake, diver work and underwater concrete, similar to this project. However, project was more than 10 years ago and was less than \$1,000,000.
- Squaw Creek Replacement of Water Intake by Barcus involving sheet piling work for a construction cost of \$800,000. Intake was a concrete structure built within a cofferdam.
- Fairfax Drainage District Missouri River Outfall Structure by Barcus involving sheet piling, diver work and underwater concrete for a construction cost of \$800,000.
- Springfield (Missouri) 48-inch Raw Water Main by Redford involving installation of 2800 feet of 48-inch DIP for a construction cost of \$1,802,000.
- Lawrence (Kansas) 23rd Street Utilities Relocation project by Redford involving replacement/relocation of 8-inch thru 12-inch water main and 12-inch thru 48-inch sanitary sewer for a construction cost of \$1,216,000.

We believe both companies have the capabilities to complete the project from our experience with them on past projects, review of the submitted information, and reference checks. Since Wolf provided the low lump sum base bid, we recommend moving forward with Wolf.

Unit Adjustment Prices

Even though the bids must be evaluated based on the lump sum bids received (per Article 19 of the Instructions to Bidders), the following summarizes our evaluation of the unit adjustment prices:

- Dredging and Disposal. Wolf provided a price of \$50.00/cubic yard (cy), which is significantly lower than Barcus' price of \$250.00/cy.
- Permanent Sheet Pile. Wolf's price of \$38.00/square foot (sf) is reasonable, compared to B&V's opinion of probable cost, and is about 18% higher than Barcus' price of \$32.00/sf. The estimated quantity of 30,000 sf includes approximately 10% contingency. This

quantity should not be exceeded unless the bedrock elevation in the river is much deeper than anticipated.

- Mobilization/Demobilization for Flooding. Wolf's price of \$10,000.00 for each mobilization/demobilization is reasonable and significantly lower than Barcus' price of \$90,000.00. As defined in the Measurement and Payment section, the bid includes the cost for two mobilizations/demobilizations in the event flooding occurs. This deductive price would be used if one or no flooding events occur. The resultant Contract Prices would be as follows:

Wolf	Barcus
One Flood	One Flood
\$3,790,000.00	\$3,790,000.00
No Floods	No Floods
\$3,780,000.00	\$3,700,000.00

While the evaluation shows that Barcus' final contract price could be lower than Wolf's should no flood events occur, the basis of award is to be made on the lump sum bid price as indicated above.

Financial Status

We have reviewed Wolf's financial status by obtaining a Dun & Bradstreet report. The report indicates the following:

- Registered as a Corporation in the state of Kansas in May of 1983 and is currently registered in good standing with the Secretary of State/Corporations Division.
- Located in Topeka, Kansas and has 55 employees.
- Standard Industrial Codes listed as a contractor of industrial buildings and renovation, remodeling or repairs (100%).
- Credit rating of 1R3, where 1R indicates 10 or more employees and 3 represents a fair credit rating (1 is lowest risk; 5 highest risk), which ranks them in the top 23.5% of companies in the Dun & Bradstreet database.

There is no information in the report that concerns us regarding their financial stability.

List of Subcontractors

We have reviewed the subcontractors that Wolf submitted in the List of Subcontractors. Wolf is listed to self-perform the dewatering, piping excavation and installation, and concrete work. Black & Veatch has previously worked with Berkel & Company (Cofferdam) and Kingston Environmental (Asbestos Abatement). We have found each of these to be competent subcontractors. We have no specific experience with Neale Painting and Special Coatings.

Proposed Project Manager and Superintendent

Wolf provided the names of the following individuals as the proposed Project Manager and Field Superintendent.

- Project Manager – Wolf Blaser
- Superintendent – David Dryer or Don Hall

From reference checks and/or their performance on previous Black & Veatch projects, all seem experienced and qualified to serve in their respective roles for this project.

Summary

Based on the above review and their performance on projects with Black & Veatch, it is our opinion that Wolf is qualified to satisfactorily complete the Kaw WTP Raw Water Intake project. We have contacted Wolf regarding their bid, and they maintain confidence in their bid and are prepared to proceed. As such, we recommend that the City award the contract to Wolf at a total price of \$3,800,000.00.

If you have any questions concerning our recommendation, please contact us.

Sincerely,

BLACK & VEATCH CORPORATION



Mark D. Bushouse
Senior Engineering Manager

Enclosures

* * * B I D T A B U L A T I O N * * *

BLACK & VEATCH
Project No. 176399

FOR: Lawrence, Kansas
City Project No. UT1102KA
Kaw WTP Raw Water Intake
City Bid No. B1359

BIDS RECEIVED:
Until 2:00 p.m., November 19, 2013
at the office of the City Clerk
in Lawrence, Kansas

PROJECT PERSONNEL
Project Manager: Andrew Hansen
Engineering Manager: Mark Bushouse

NAME OF BIDDER ADDRESS OF BIDDER	Kissick Construction Co., Inc. 8131 Indiana Kansas City, MO 64132	Wolf Construction, Inc. 5630 SW Randolph Topeka, KS 66609	L.G. Barcus and Sons, Inc. 1430 State Ave. Kansas City, KS 66102	Engineer Opinion of Probable Construction Cost
Item Description		Recommend Award		
Addenda Acknowledged				
No. 1	Yes	Yes	Yes	
No. 2	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Lump Sum Total	\$6,193,550.00	\$3,800,000.00	\$3,880,000.00	\$4,702,000.00
Includes two Mobilization/Demobilization				
Bid Security	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Unit Price Adjustments				
Dredging and Disposal, \$/cy	\$52.00	\$50.00	\$250.00	
Permanent Sheet Pile, \$/sf	\$58.00	\$38.00	\$32.00	
Mobilization/Demobilization, each	\$18,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$90,000.00	
List of Subcontractors				
Excavation	Kissick	Wolf Construction	L.G. Barcus	
Dewatering	--	Wolf Construction	L.G. Barcus	
Cofferdam	Kissick	Berkel & Co.	L.G. Barcus	
Piping	Kissick	Wolf Construction	L.G. Barcus & Redford	
Concrete	Kissick	Wolf Construction	L.G. Barcus	
Painting	--	Neale Painting & Special Coatings	Thomas Industrial Coatings	
Hazardous Environment Condition Removal	--	Kingston Environmental	L.G. Barcus	